

The Doctrine of the Trinity

PhD – CHTH G105-C07

MA – TH 6ZR6

McMaster Divinity College
Fall 2020
Hybrid

Steven M. Studebaker, Ph.D.
Phone: 585-866-9632
Email: studeba@mcmaster.ca
Office: 216
Office hours: by appointment on Zoom

I. Course Description

This course is an in-depth study of the doctrine of the Trinity. It considers issues related to theological method and the Trinity as well as the historical development of the doctrine through an examination of central figures, events, and periods. The course will include a virtual seminar format, which invites a high level of student participation through the presentation of student research and discussions.

II. Course Objectives

Knowing

- Learn primary figures in the history of trinitarian theology
- Learn key historical moments in the history of trinitarian theology
- Learn key terms and concepts of trinitarian theology
- Learn key figures and movements in contemporary trinitarian theology
- Learn key contributions to the Trinity from non-Western figures

Being

- Develop a sense for the significance of the Trinity for Christian formation
- Appreciate the value of diverse trinitarian traditions, especially the contributions from non-Western sources

Doing

- Engage in scholarly and professional interaction with colleagues
- Read and intelligently discuss assigned readings
- Present a scholarly analysis of a primary text related to the Trinity
- Write and present a scholarly book review on a significant secondary source treating the Trinity
- Write and present a scholarly research-thesis paper on a topic related to the Trinity
- Respond to and facilitate a scholarly and collegial in-class discussion on a thesis paper

III. Course Texts

A. Required:

1. Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, *The Trinity: Global Perspectives* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2007).
2. Gene L. Green, Stephen T. Pardue, and K. K. Yeo, *The Trinity Among the Nations: The Doctrine of God in the Majority World* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2015).

B. Reserve Readings:

- This is a preliminary list; specifications will be given in class. Limitations may arise on accessibility to resources given continuing social distancing and the hybrid nature of this course. Consequently, e-copies of supplementary readings will be made available.

Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae* (England: Blackfriars, 1964).

Aurelius Augustine, *The Works of Saint Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century*, ed. John E. Rotelle, vol. 5, *The Trinity*, ed. Edmund Hill (Brooklyn, N.Y.: New City Press, 1991).

Karl Rahner, *The Trinity*, trans. Joseph Donceel; intro. Catherine Mowry LaCugna (New York: Crossroad, 1998).

Richard de Saint-Victor: La Trinité, intro. and trans. Gaston Salet, *Sources Chrétiennes*, 63, ed. H. de Lubac and J. Daniélou (Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1959).

English translations are available—e.g., *On the Trinity: Richard of Saint Victor*, trans. and commentary by Ruben Agelici (Cambridge: James Clarke, 2011). E-copy available through MILLS.

Friedrich Schleiermacher, *The Christian Faith*, trans. and ed. H. R. Mackintosh and J. S. Stewart (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1928), 738–51 “Conclusion: The Divine Trinity.”

IV. Course Assignments

| Assignment | Percent | Due Date |
|---|---------|-----------------------------|
| A. Primary Text Paper | 10% | Oct 16 |
| B. Syllabus, Lecture, & Annotated Bibliography: | 35% | Nov 6 |
| 1. Lecture | 25% | |
| 2. Syllabus & Annotated bibliography | 10% | |
| C. Paper Response and Facilitation | 10% | Day of presentation |
| D. Thesis Paper and Presentation | 45% | One week after presentation |
| 1. Presentation | 15% | |
| 2. Paper | 30% | |

E. Participation: $\frac{X}{\text{Total: 100\%}}$ Every class session

V. Course Outline

• *final presentation schedule and lecture outline may vary depending on final course enrolment* •

| Part One: Online | | | |
|---------------------------------|-------------|---|--|
| Week | Date | Topic | Due Dates & Reminders |
| 1 | Sept 14 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Live session for Personal Introductions and Course Overview (45 min. Zoom session TBD) I. Introduction to the Trinity (online lecture) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Select a text for the primary text paper |
| 2 | Sept 21 | II. The Trinity & Theological Method (online lecture) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Live session (30 min): discussion of Theological Method (TBD, later in week to provide time for viewing lecture content). | |
| 3 | Sept 28 | III. Biblical Trinitarian Theology (online lecture) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Live session (30 min): discussion of syllabus and lecture assignment and presentation. | |
| 4 | Oct 5 | IV. Historical & Contemporary Trinitarian Theology (online lecture) A. Eastern and Western Live session (30 min): discussion of lecture content (TBD, later in week to provide time for viewing lecture content). | |
| 5 | Oct 12 | * Monday (Oct 12) is Thanksgiving B. Modern Renaissance? | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Primary Text Paper due Oct 16 |
| Part Two: Campus Session | | | |

| 6 Day 1 Oct 22 | 9:30-Noon | C. Pentecostal Trinitarian Theology—1) Trinity and Creation-Redemption | • We will take regular breaks during these time blocs | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------------------------|------------|--|---|---------|------------|----|----|--|----|--|----|--|----|--|----|--|--|
| | Noon-12:30 | Lunch provided | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | 12:30-4:00 | Lecture Presentations (depending on time, we may finish the lectures Friday morning) <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Lecture</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>1.</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>2.</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>3.</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>4.</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>5.</td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>6.</td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table> | | Lecture | 1. | | 2. | | 3. | | 4. | | 5. | | 6. | | |
| | Lecture | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 5. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 6. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Day 2 Oct 23 | 9:30-1:00 | C. Pentecostal Trinitarian Theology—2) Spirit of Christ and Spirit of Pentecost | • We will take regular breaks during these time blocs | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Part Three: Online | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 7 | Oct 26 | Travel and Catch Up Week | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 8 | Nov 2 | One-on-one Discussion with Studebaker on Major Paper (TBD on Zoom, approx. 20-30 min) | • Syllabus and annotated bibliography due Nov 6 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 9 | Nov 9 | D. The Trinity & Religious Pluralism (online lecture) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 10 | Nov 16 | Paper Presentation & Collaboration: <i>Week one</i> Live Zoom session: each presentation and response is 30 minutes, so total time is 1 hour. <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Paper</th> <th>Respondent</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>1.</td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td>2.</td><td></td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table> | | Paper | Respondent | 1. | | | 2. | | | | | | | | |
| | Paper | Respondent | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| 11 | Nov 23 | <p>Paper Presentation & Collaboration: <i>Week two</i></p> <p>Live Zoom session: each presentation and response is 30 minutes, so total time is 1 hour.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Paper</th> <th>Respondent</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>3.</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>4.</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | | Paper | Respondent | 3. | | | 4. | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Week one papers due |
|----|--------|--|---|-------|------------|----|--|--|----|--|--|---|
| | Paper | Respondent | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 12 | Nov 30 | <p>Paper Presentation & Collaboration: <i>Week Three</i></p> <p>Live Zoom session: each presentation and response is 30 minutes, so total time is 1 hour.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Paper</th> <th>Respondent</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>5.</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>6.</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | | Paper | Respondent | 5. | | | 6. | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Week two papers due |
| | Paper | Respondent | | | | | | | | | | |
| 5. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 6. | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 13 | Dec 11 | Conclusion and Assessment | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Week three papers due | | | | | | | | | |

VI. Assignment Descriptions:

A. Primary Text Analysis and Presentation:

The assignment sharpens your skills in the close reading and interpretation of primary texts.

1. Select a significant primary text (several shorter selections are also acceptable).
2. Write an analysis of the text that identifies the thesis, logic, arguments, key Scriptures, philosophical assumptions, etc. and discusses significant secondary scholarship on the piece.

A sample outline is:

- a. Theological and historical context of and influences on the writing
- b. Thesis
- c. Outline of the content
- d. Critical analysis—does the content support the thesis, is the content consistent, advance a new perspective, etc.?

- e. Statement of the text's contribution to the doctrine of the Trinity and your research
3. Written submission: 2–3 page outline that includes:
 - Brief summary of the content and analysis of the text
 - Bibliography with critical edition(s), scholarly translations (where appropriate), and key secondary literature on the writing(s) and figure.
 4. Possible sources:
 - Augustine, *The Trinity* books 4, 5, and 15
 - Gregory of Nyssa, *On "Not Three Gods," On the Holy Spirit* (Good background reading: Lewis Ayres, *Nicaea and Its Legacy* and *Augustine and the Trinity*)
 - Richard of St. Victor, *The Trinity*, book three
 - Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae* 1a.27-30, 34-38, and 43
 - Friedrich Schleiermacher
 - Karl Barth
 - Karl Rahner
 - John Zizioulas (Eastern Orthodox)
 - Catherine Mowry LaCugna
 - Jürgen Moltmann
 - Wolfhart Pannenberg
 - David Coffey

B. Lecture, Syllabus, and Annotated Bibliography:

1. Purpose:
This assignment provides experience *preparing* a syllabus and *delivering* a lecture for teaching in an undergraduate setting. The preparation of the syllabus also fulfills one of the requirements of the Mastery Checklist.
2. Description:
You will prepare a syllabus and lecture on a topic related to the course topic. The lecture should be one of the lectures listed in your syllabus. You may use this assignment to investigate an area that will promote your research program (e.g., prepare for doctoral comprehensive exams and MA thesis/PhD dissertation topics). You should, however, *gear the syllabus and the lecture toward an undergraduate audience*.

* Although this class is on the Trinity, the syllabus and lecture can address broader topics.
3. Guidelines:

- a. Research:
 - 1) Research for the lecture and syllabus development will account for the supplemental reading for research degree students (approximately 5,000-6,000 pages)
 - 2) Documentation of reading:
Please provide an annotated bibliography of the reading consulted in the preparation of the lecture (the annotations for the texts should be about one paragraph—identify the key thesis and contributions of the text).
 - b. Lecture:
 - 1) The lecture should present and discuss the primary content points of the topic (or sub-topic)
 - 2) Lecture handouts/outlines and PowerPoint/Prezi are helpful, but not required
 - 3) Length:
The lecture and discussion will take either thirty or fifty-minutes, depending on final student numbers in the course.
 - 4) Note: The lecture will be presented in the afternoon of the first day of class (Thurs Oct 22). If COVID-19 requires the conversion of this class to all online delivery, you will post a video presentation of your lecture and will have the opportunity to provide feedback to your class colleagues in an online venue.
4. Evaluation:
Grading of the lecture and discussion session will be based on the following . . .
- a. Please submit to the professor a copy (electronic on Avenue to Learn) of the syllabus, the lecture notes, and annotated bibliography used to develop the lecture.
 - b. Does the lecture accurately present and discuss the topic?
 - c. Does the lecture engage in critical evaluation/discussion of the content?
 - d. Does the lecture highlight the transcendent value of the material—e.g., does it have value for contemporary Christian thought, life, and ministry?
 - c. Does the lecture facilitate student discussion?

C. Paper Response and Facilitation:
Each student *prepares a critique* and *facilitates a discussion* of a thesis paper presentation.
This gives the student experience in moderating academic presentations and discussions.

1. The Critique:

- a. Remember to be charitable; it is not only Christian, but since academia is a small guild, it is also self-preservation.
- b. Critical (includes highlighting and discussing problems *and* strengths):
The critique should explore the following sorts of issues:
 - Does the paper have a thesis?
 - Does the content develop and support the thesis?
 - Does it use appropriate primary sources?
 - Does it interact with the relevant secondary literature?
- c. Time and discussion management:
 - You should keep the presentation to time limit (30 min) and effectively manage student discussion (do not let one person dominate the interaction; move on to a new issue if discussion begins to go off on tangents and chase rabbit trails).
 - Endeavor to elicit comments from all people virtually present.

2. Guidelines:

- a. The paper presentation is 15-20 minutes. The facilitation is 15-10 minutes. Together, the paper and facilitation take 30 minutes. The paper presentations and responses will take place during live Zoom sessions.
- b. The presentation and discussion typically includes the following items:
 - 1) Presenter briefly summarizes paper's thesis and argument and offers any retractions, developments, and corrections.
 - 2) Facilitators response:
You can go through point by point as a monologue or start by raising and offering your thoughts on the paper's primary contributions and arguments and invite discussion based on your remarks and interaction with the presenter and then so forth through the rest of the points you have identified.

- c. A written submission is not required but is encouraged as it may be beneficial to other students in the course.

D. Thesis Paper and Presentation (final paper due one week after class presentation):

1. Each student writes and presents a thesis paper on a topic related to the topic of the course. I encourage you to investigate the issue from the perspective of your discipline and area(s) of research interest—e.g., the Trinity and Ecclesiology or the Trinity in the Synoptics.
2. The purpose of this assignment is to provide students with experience in writing academic conference and journal article length theological papers and to gain experience in presenting research in an oral form similar to that performed at academic conferences.
3. Students are encouraged to use the class as an opportunity to work on papers they can present at academic societies and/or submit for publication.
4. Mechanics:
 - Provide a copy of the paper (rough, but not incoherent draft) to students and professor *one week before presentation*
 - Submit final copy of the paper *one week after class presentation*
 - Length: approx. 20 pages or 6,000–7,000 words.
 - Style: conform to MacDiv Style Guide (please use footnotes and include a bibliography of sources cited in the paper).

VIII. Policies

A. Textbook Purchase

All required textbooks for this class are available from the College's book service, READ On Bookstore, Room 145, McMaster Divinity College. Texts may be purchased on the first day of class. For advance purchase, you may contact READ On Bookstore, 5 International Blvd, Etobicoke, Ontario M9W 6H3: phone 416.620.2934; fax 416.622.2308; email books@readon.ca. Other book services may also carry the texts.

B. Academic Honesty

Academic dishonesty is a serious offence that may take any number of forms, including plagiarism, the submission of work that is not one's own or for which previous credit has been obtained, and/or unauthorized collaboration with other students. Academic dishonesty can result in severe consequences, e.g., failure of the assignment, failure of the course, a notation on one's academic transcript, and/or suspension or expulsion from the College.

Students are responsible for understanding what constitutes academic dishonesty. Please refer to the Divinity College Statement on Academic Honesty ~ <https://mcmasterdivinity.ca/rules-regulations/>

C. Gender Inclusive Language

McMaster Divinity College uses inclusive language for human beings in worship services, student written materials, and all its publications. It is expected that inclusive language will be used in chapel services and all MDC assignments. In reference to biblical texts, the integrity of the original expressions and the names of God should be respected, but you will need to use gender-inclusive language for humans, and you will need to quote from a gender-inclusive version such as the following: NRSV (1989), NCV (1991), TEV/GNB/GNT (1992), CEV (1995), NLT (1996), TNIV (2005), and the Common English Bible (CEB 2011).

D. Style

All stylistic considerations (including but not limited to questions of formatting, footnotes, and bibliographic references) must conform to the McMaster Divinity College Style Guidelines for Essays and Theses <http://mcmasterdivinity.ca/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/mdcstyleguide.pdf> Failure to observe appropriate form will result in grade reductions.

IX. Late-Assignment and Exam Policy

- A. Assignments are due at the beginning of class on the date specified in the syllabus.
- B. Students take exams on the date and at the time scheduled in the syllabus.
- C. Late assignments are reduced five percentage points for each day late (e.g., if the grade is 90 and it is one day late [after the beginning of class equals one day late], the grade will be reduced to 85).
- D. Assignments and exams will be accepted without penalty after the specified date in the syllabus only in the case of an excused absence. If a student misses an exam or assignment submission due to a reason that he/she believes is excusable, then he/she must notify the instructor and schedule an exam date and/or late-assignment submission date within twenty-four hours of the beginning of the missed class session.
- E. Assignments and exams will not be accepted late on the basis of the student's involvement with school-approved activities. If you are not able to be in class for an exam or assignment submission, then you must pre-arrange with the instructor to take the exam and/or submit the assignment before the scheduled date in the syllabus.

Disclaimer

This syllabus is the property of the instructor and is prepared with currently available information. The instructor reserves the right to make changes and revisions up to and including the first day of class.

X. Bibliography

The bibliography is not exhaustive, but should provide an entry point for literature on the doctrine of the Trinity.

Primary sources

Aquinas, Thomas. *Summa Theologiæ*. England: Blackfriars, 1964.

Augustine, Aurelius. *De Trinitate Libri XV (Libri XIII-XV)*, ed. W. J. Mountain and Rev. Glorie. Corpus Christianorum Series Latina 50A. Turnholti: Typographi Brepols Editores Pontificii, 1968.

_____. *The Fathers of the Church: A New Translation*. Vol. 1, *St. Augustine: Letters*. Trans. Wilfrid Parsons. New York: Fathers of the Church, 1951.

_____. *The Fathers of the Church: A New Translation*. Vol. 4, *St. Augustine: Letters*. Trans. Wilfrid Parsons. New York: Fathers of the Church, 1955.

_____. *The Fathers of the Church: A New Translation*. Vol. 18, *St. Augustine: Letters*. Vol. 2. Trans. Wilfrid Parsons. 1953. Reprint, New York: Fathers of the Church, 1966.

_____. *The Fathers of the Church*. Vol. 70, *St. Augustine: Eighty-Three Different Questions*. Trans. David L. Mosher. Washington, D. C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 1982.

_____. *The Fathers of the Church: A New Translation*. Vol. 79, *St. Augustine: Tractates on the Gospel of John 11-27*. Trans. John W. Rettig. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University Press of America, 1988.

_____. *The Works of Saint Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century*. Ed. John E. Rotelle. Vol. 4, *Sermons on the New Testament (part 3), Sermons 51-94*. Trans. Edmund Hill. Brooklyn, N.Y.: New City Press, 1991.

_____. *The Works of Saint Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century*. Ed. John E. Rotelle. Vol. 5, *The Trinity*. Ed. Edmund Hill. Brooklyn, N.Y.: New City Press, 1991.

Richard de Saint-Victor: La Trinité. Intro. and trans. Gaston Salet. *Sources Chrétiennes*, 63, ed. H. de Lubac and J. Daniélou. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1959.

Saint Ambrose: Theological and Dogmatic Works. Trans. Roy J. Deferrari. Vol. 44, *The Fathers of the Church: A New Translation*. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1963.

Schaff, Philip, ed. *A Select Library of Nicene and post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church (second series)*. 14 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1956-.

_____. *The Creeds of Christendom: With a History and Critical Notes*. 3 vols. 6th ed. and rev. ed. 1931. Reprint, Grand Rapids: Baker, 1998.

Secondary sources

Ayres, Lewis. *Nicaea and Its Legacy: An Approach to Fourth-Century Trinitarian Theology* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004).

_____. "On not Three People: The Fundamental Themes of Gregory of Nyssa's Trinitarian Theology as seen in *To Ablabius: On not Three Gods*." *Modern Theology* 18 (2002): 445-474.

_____. "'Remember that You are Catholic' (serm. 52.2): Augustine on the Unity of the Triune God." *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 8 (2000): 39-82.

_____. "The Fundamental Grammar of Augustine's Trinitarian Theology." In *Augustine and His Critics: Essays in Honor of Gerald Bonner*, ed. Robert Dodaro and George Lawless, 51-76. New York: Routledge, 2000.

Babcock, William S. "A Changing of the Christian God: The Doctrine of the Trinity in the Seventeenth Century." *Interpretation* 45 (1991): 133-146.

Badcock, Gary D. *Light of Truth and Fire of Love: A Theology of the Holy Spirit*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1997.

Barnes, Michel René. "Augustine in Contemporary Trinitarian Theology." *Theological Studies* 56 (1995): 237-250.

_____. "De Régnon Reconsidered." *Augustinian Studies* 26 (1995): 51-79.

_____. "Divine Unity and the Divided Self: Gregory of Nyssa's Trinitarian Theology in its Psychological Context." *Modern Theology* 18 (2002): 475-496.

_____. "One Nature, One Power: Consensus Doctrine in Pro-Nicene Polemic." In *Studia Patristica*, vol. 29, ed. Elizabeth A. Livingstone, 205-223. Leuven: Peeters, 1997.

_____. *The Power of God: Δύναμις in Gregory of Nyssa's Trinitarian Theology*. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 2001.

_____. "Rereading Augustine's Theology of the Trinity." In *The Trinity: An Interdisciplinary Symposium on the Trinity*, ed. Stephen T. Davis, Daniel Kendall, and Gerald O'Collins, 145-176. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.

Barth, Karl. *Church Dogmatics*. Trans. G. T. Thompson, et al. 5 vols. in 14. Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1936-1977.

Boff, Leonardo. *Trinity and Society*. Trans. Paul Burns. Theology and Liberation Series. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1988.

Bok, Nico den. *Communicating the Most High: A Systematic Study of Person and Trinity in the Theology of*

- Richard of St. Victor* (†1173). *Bibliotheca Victorina*, 7. Paris: Brepols, 1996.
- Brachtendorf, Johannes. "Der menschliche Geist als Bild des trinitarischen Gottes: Ähnlichkeiten und Unähnlichkeiten." In *Gott und sein Bild: Augustins "De Trinitate" im Spiegel gegenwärtiger Forschung*, ed. Johannes Brachtendorf. Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh, 2000.
- Brown, David. *The Divine Trinity*. La Salle, Ill.: Open Court, 1985.
- Butin, Philip W. *Revelation, Redemption, and Response: Calvin's Trinitarian Understanding of the Divine-Human Relationship*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Clark, Mary T. "Augustine's Theology of the Trinity: Its Relevance." *Dionysius* 13 (1989): 71-84.
- _____. *Augustinian Personalism*. Ed. Robert P. Russell. The Saint Augustine Lecture Series, 1969. Villanova, Pa.: Villanova University Press, 1970.
- _____. "De Trinitate." In *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine*, ed. Eleonore Stump and Norman Kretzman, 91-102. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- _____. "The Trinity in Latin Christianity." In *Christian Spirituality: Origins to the Twelfth Century*, ed. Bernard McGinn and John Meyendorff, 276-290. *World Spirituality: An Encyclopedic History of the Religious Quest*, 16, gen. ed. Ewert Cousins. New York: Crossroad, 1985.
- Coakley, Sarah. "'Persons' in the 'Social' Doctrine of the Trinity: A Critique of Current Analytic Discussion." In *The Trinity: An Interdisciplinary Symposium on the Trinity*, ed. Stephen T. Davis, Daniel Kendall, and Gerald O'Collins, 123-144. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Coffey, David. *Deus Trinitas: The Doctrine of the Triune God*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- _____. *Grace: The Gift of the Holy Spirit*. Faith and Culture, 2, ed. Neil Brown. Manly, N.S.W., Australia: Catholic Institute of Sydney, 1979.
- _____. "The Holy Spirit as the Mutual Love of the Father and the Son." *Theological Studies* 51 (1990): 193-229.
- Congar, Yves M. J. *I Believe in the Holy Spirit*. 3 vols. Trans. David Smith. New York: Seabury, 1983.
- Cunningham, David S. "Trinitarian Theology since 1990." *Reviews in Religion and Theology* 4 (1995): 8-16.
- Fatula, Mary Ann. *The Holy Spirit: Unbounded Gift of Joy*. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical, 1998.
- Fortman, Edmund J. *The Triune God: A Historical Study of the Doctrine of the Trinity*. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1972.
- Gresham Jr., John L. "The Social Model of the Trinity and Its Critics." *Scottish Journal of Theology* 46 (1993): 325-343.

- Gunton, Colin. "Augustine, the Trinity, and the Theological Crisis in the West." *Scottish Journal of Theology* 43 (1990): 33-58.
- _____. "Being and Person: T. F. Torrance's Doctrine of God." In *The Promise of Trinitarian Theology: Theologians in Dialogue with T. F. Torrance*, ed. Elmer M. Colyer, 115-137. Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield, 2001.
- _____. *The Promise of Trinitarian Theology*. 2nd ed. Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1997.
- Hall, Stuart G. *Doctrine and Practice in the Early Church*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1991.
- Hallamaa, Jaana. "The Concept of Person and God as Trinity of Persons." In *Philosophical Studies in Religion, Metaphysics, and Ethics: Essays in Honour of Heikki Kirjavainen*, ed. Timo Koistinen and Tommi Lehtonen, 140-159. Schriften der Luther-Agricola-Gesellschaft, 38. Helsinki: Luther-Agricola-Society, 1997.
- Hanson, Richard. "The Achievement of Orthodoxy in the Fourth Century AD." In *The Making of Orthodoxy*, ed. Rowan Williams, 142-156. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.
- Hanson, R. P. C. *The Search for the Christian Doctrine of God: The Arian Controversy*. Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1988.
- Harrison, Carol. *Augustine: Christian Truth and Fractured Humanity*. Christian Theology in Context. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Hart, David B. "The Mirror of the Infinite: Gregory of Nyssa on the *Vestigia Trinitatis*." *Modern Theology* 18 (2002): 541-561.
- Hasker, William. "Tri-Unity," *The Journal of Religion* 50 (1970): 1-32.
- Hill, Edmund. "Augustine's Method in the *De Trinitate*: A Model for Text Books and Catechisms." In *Gott und sein Bild: Augustins "De Trinitate" im Spiegel gegenwärtiger Forschung*, ed. Johannes Brachtendorf, 29-37. Paderborn: Ferdinand Schöningh, 2000.
- _____. Introduction to *The Works of Saint Augustine: A Translation for the 21st Century*, part 1, vol. 5, ed. John E. Rotelle. Trans. Edmund Hill. Brooklyn: New City, 1991.
- _____. "Karl Rahner's 'Remarks on the Dogmatic Treatise *De Trinitate* and St. Augustine.'" *Augustinian Studies* 2 (1971): 67-80.
- _____. *The Mystery of the Trinity*. Introducing Catholic Theology, 4. London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1985.
- Hill, William J. *The Three-Personed God: The Trinity as a Mystery of Salvation*. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1982.

- Hodgson, Leonard. *The Doctrine of the Trinity: Croall Lectures, 1942-1943*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1944.
- _____. "The Doctrine of the Trinity: Some Further Thoughts." *The Journal of Theological Studies* n.s. 5 (1954): 49-55.
- Holmes, Stephen R. *God of Grace and God of Glory: An Account of the Theology of Jonathan Edwards*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001.
- Illingworth, J. R. *The Doctrine of the Trinity: Apologetically Considered*. London: Macmillan, 1907.
- Jenson, Robert. *The Triune Identity: God according to the Gospel*. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1982.
- Kannengiesser, Charles. *Arius and Athanasius: Two Alexandrian Theologians*. Collected Studies Series. Great Britain: Variorum, 1991.
- Kelly, J. N. D. *The Athanasian Creed: The Paddock Lectures for 1962-3*. New York: Harper and Row, 1964.
- LaCugna, Catherine Mowry. *God for Us: The Trinity and Christian Life*. New York: HarperCollins, 1991.
- Layman, C. Stephen. "Tritheism and the Trinity." *Faith and Philosophy* 5 (1988): 291-298.
- Leftow, Brian. "Anti Social Trinitarianism." In *The Trinity: An Interdisciplinary Symposium on the Trinity*, ed. Stephen T. Davis, Daniel Kendall, and Gerald O'Collins, 203-249. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Lossky, Vladimir. *Essai sur la théologie mystique de l'Eglise d'Orient*. Paris: 1944.
- _____. *In the Image and Likeness of God*. Ed. John E. Erickson and Thomas E. Bird. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1985.
- _____. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1976.
- Lowry, Charles. *The Trinity and Christian Devotion*. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1946.
- Luibhéid, Colm. *Eusebius of Caesarea and the Arian Crisis*. Ireland: Officina Typographica, Irish Academic Press, 1981.
- _____. *The Council of Nicea*. Ireland: Officina Typographica, Galway University Press, 1982.
- Marsh, Thomas A. *The Triune God: A Biblical, Historical, and Theological Study*. Blackrock, Dublin: Columbia, 1994.
- McKenna, Stephen. Introduction to *De Trinitate: St. Augustine: The Trinity*. Trans. Stephen McKenna. Vol. 45,

The Fathers of the Church: A New Translation. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1963.

Merriell, D. Juvenal. *To the Image of the Trinity: A Study in the Development of Aquinas' Teaching*. Studies and Texts, 96. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1990.

Moltmann, Jürgen. *The Trinity and the Kingdom: The Doctrine of God*. Trans. Margaret Kohl. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1981.

_____. *Trinität und Reich Gottes: zur Gotteslehre*. München: Kaiser, 1980.

Muller, Earl. "The Dynamic of Augustine's *De Trinitate*: A Response to a Recent Characterization." *Augustinian Studies* 26 (1995): 65-91.

O'Collins, Gerald. *The Tripersonal God: Understanding and Interpreting the Trinity*. New York: Paulist, 1999.

Plantinga, Jr., Cornelius. "Gregory of Nyssa and the Social Analogy of the Trinity." *The Thomist* 50 (1986): 325-52.

_____. "Social Trinity and Tritheism." In *Trinity, Incarnation, and Atonement: Philosophical and Theological Essays*. Library of Religious Philosophy, ed. Ronald J. Feenstra and Cornelius Plantinga Jr., 21-47. Vol. 1. Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 1989.

_____. "The Fourth Gospel as Trinitarian Source Then and Now." In *Biblical Hermeneutics in Historical Perspective: Studies in Honor of Karlfried Froehlich on His Sixtieth Birthday*, ed. Mark S. Burrows and Paul Rorem, 303-321. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1991.

_____. "The Threeness/Oneness Problem of the Trinity." *Calvin Theological Journal* 23 (1988): 37-53.

Plantinga Pauw, Amy. "'Heaven is a World of Love': Edwards on Heaven and the Trinity." *Calvin Theological Journal* 30 (1995): 392-401.

Ratzinger, Joseph. "The Holy Spirit as *Communio*: Concerning the Relationship of Pneumatology and Spirituality in Augustine." *Communio* 25 (1998): 324-339; translation of Ratzinger, "Lo Spirito Santo come *communio*." In *La riscoperta dello Spirito*, 251-267. Milan: Jaca Book, 1977.

Régnon, Theodore de. *Études de théologie positive sur la Sainté Trinité*. Four volumes bound as three. Paris: Victor Retaux, 1892/1898.

Rist, John M. "Basil's 'Neoplatonism': Its Background and Nature." In *Basil of Caesarea: Christian, Humanist, Ascetic: A Sixteen-Hundredth Anniversary Symposium*, ed. Paul J. Fedwick, 137-220. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1981.

Rogers, Katherin. "The Traditional Doctrine of Divine Simplicity." *Religious Studies* 32 (1996): 165-186.

Rusch, William G. Introduction to *The Trinitarian Controversy*. Sources of Early Christian Thought.

Philadelphia: Fortress, 1980.

- Schwöbel, Christoph. Introduction to *Trinitarian Theology Today: Essays on Divine Being and Act*, ed. Christoph Schwöbel. Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1995. Smith, Timothy L. *Thomas Aquinas' Trinitarian Theology: A Study in Theological Method*. Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 2003.
- Studebaker, Steven M. "Integrating Pneumatology and Christology: A Trinitarian Modification of Clark H. Pinnock's Spirit Christology." *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 27 (2006): 5-20.
- _____. "Jonathan Edwards' Social Augustinian Trinitarianism: An Alternative to a Recent Trend." *Scottish Journal of Theology* 56 (2003): 268-85.
- _____. "Supreme Harmony or Supreme Disharmony? An Analysis of Amy Plantinga Pauw's 'The Supreme Harmony of All': The Trinitarian Theology of Jonathan Edwards." Article Review for *Scottish Journal of Theology* 57 (2004): 479-485. *Her response to my essay is published after mine in the same volume.
- Studer, Basil. *The Grace of Christ and the Grace of God in Augustine of Hippo: Christocentrism or Theocentrism?* Trans. Matthew J. O'Connell. Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1997.
- Tercescu, Lucian. "'Person' versus 'Individual', and other Modern Misreadings of Gregroy of Nyssa." *Modern Theology* 18 (2002): 527-539.
- Thiel, Udo. "The Trinity and Human Personal Identity." In *English Philosophy in the Age of Locke*, ed. M. A. Stewart, 217-243. Oxford Studies in the History of Philosophy, 3. Oxford: Clarendon, 2000.
- Thompson, Thomas. "Trinitarianism Today: Doctrinal Renaissance, Ethical Relevance, Social Redolence." *Calvin Theological Journal* 32 (1997): 9-42.
- Weber, Richard M. "The Trinitarian Theology of Jonathan Edwards: An Investigation of Charges against Its Orthodoxy." *Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society* 44 (2001): 297-318.
- Wedeking, Gary. "Locke on Personal Identity and the Trinity Controversy of the 1690s." *Dialogue* 29 (1990): 163-188.
- Weinandy, Thomas G. *The Father's Spirit of Sonship: Reconceiving the Trinity*. Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1995.
- Welch, Claude. *The Trinity in Contemporary Theology*. London: SCM, 1953.
- Wiles, Maurice. *Archetypal Heresy: Arianism through the Centuries*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1996.
- Williams, Rowan. *Arius: Heresy and Tradition*. London: Darton, Longman, and Todd, 1987.
- _____. "Sapientia and the Trinity: Reflections on the *De Trinitate*." *Augustiniana* 40 (1990): 317-332.

Zizioulas, John D. *Being as Communion: Studies in Personhood and the Church*. Contemporary Greek Theologians, 4. Crestwood, N.Y.: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1985.